

HOMOGENEOUS POLYNOMIALS WITH TWO SETS  
COMPUTING THEIR SYMMETRIC TENSOR RANK

E. Ballico

Department of Mathematics  
University of Trento

38 123 Povo (Trento) - Via Sommarive, 14, ITALY

e-mail: ballico@science.unitn.it

**Abstract:** Let  $X_{m,d} \subset \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  be the order  $d$  Veronese embedding of  $\mathbb{P}^m$ . Here we classify points  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  with symmetric rank  $d + 1$  and whose symmetric rank is computed by at least 2 sets  $A, B \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  such that no 3 of the points of  $A \cup B$  are collinear. In these cases the symmetric rank is computed by an infinite (and one-dimensional) family of subsets of  $X_{m,d}$ .

**AMS Subject Classification:** 14N05

**Key Words:** rsymmetric tensor rank, Veronese variety

1. Introduction

Let  $X \subset \mathbb{P}^n$  be an integral and non-degenerate variety defined over an algebraically closed field  $\mathbb{K}$  such that  $\text{char}(\mathbb{K}) = 0$ . For any  $P \in \mathbb{P}^n$  let  $r_X(P)$  be the minimal cardinality of a set  $S \subset X$  such that  $P \in \langle S \rangle$ . The integer  $r_X(P)$  is called the  $X$ -rank of  $P$  (see [5]). Let  $\mathcal{S}(X, P)$  the set of all  $S \subset X$  computing  $r_X(P)$ , i.e. the set of all subsets  $S \subset X$  such that  $\sharp(S) = r_X(P)$  and  $P \in \langle S \rangle$ . Notice that any  $S \in \mathcal{S}(X, P)$  is linearly independent and  $P \notin \langle S' \rangle$  for any  $S' \subsetneq S$ . For every integer  $t \geq 1$  let  $\sigma_k(X)$  denote the closure in  $\mathbb{P}^n$  of all  $(k - 1)$ -dimensional linear spaces spanned by  $t$  points of  $Y$ . Set  $\sigma_0(X) := \emptyset$ . For any  $P \in \mathbb{P}^n$  the border  $X$ -rank  $b_X(P)$  is the minimal integer  $t \geq 1$  such that  $P \in \sigma_t(X)$ , i.e. the only integer  $t \geq 1$  such that  $P \in \sigma_t(X) \setminus \sigma_{t-1}(X)$ . If  $\sigma_{k-1}(X) \neq \mathbb{P}^n$ , then a general  $P \in \sigma_k(X)$  has  $X$ -rank  $k$ . An important problem is to find conditions on  $X$  and  $P$  such that  $\sharp(\mathcal{S}(X, P)) = 1$ . In [1] we

consider the construction of examples of  $(X, P)$  in which  $X$  is a smooth curve and  $\sharp(\mathcal{S}(X, P))$  is a prescribed integers. Here we consider the case in which  $X$  is a Veronese embedding of  $\mathbb{P}^m$ ,  $m \geq 2$ . In this case the  $X$ -rank is called the symmetric rank. Fix positive integers  $m, d$ . Let  $\nu_d : \mathbb{P}^m \rightarrow \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  be the order  $d$  Veronese embedding of  $\mathbb{P}^m$ . Set  $X_{m,d} := \nu_d(\mathbb{P}^m)$ . We always assume  $m \geq 2$ , because the problem is essentially empty in the case  $m = 1$ . Our starting point was an example from [2] which we recall here (see [2], Example 1, for the case  $m = 2$ ).

**Example 1.** Assume  $m = 2$  and  $d \geq 4$ . Let  $D \subset \mathbb{P}^2$  be a smooth conic. Fix sets  $S, S' \subset D$  such that  $\sharp(S) = \sharp(S') = d + 1$  and  $S \cap S' = \emptyset$ . Since no 3 points of  $D$  are collinear, the sets  $S, S'$  and  $S \cup S'$  are in linearly general position. Since  $h^0(D, \mathcal{O}_D(d)) = 2d + 1$  and  $D$  is projectively normal, we have  $h^1(\mathcal{I}_S(d)) = h^1(\mathcal{I}_{S'}(d)) = 0$  and  $h^1(\mathcal{I}_{S \cup S'}(d)) = 1$ . Thus  $\nu_d(S)$  and  $\nu_d(S')$  are linearly independent and  $\langle \nu_d(S) \rangle \cap \langle \nu_d(S') \rangle$  is a unique point. Call  $P$  this point. Obviously  $r_X(P) \leq d + 1$ . We first check that  $b_{X_{2,d}}(P) \geq d + 1$ . Assume  $b_X(P) \leq d$  and take  $Z$  computing  $b_{X_{2,d}}(P)$ . We may apply a small part of the proof of [2], Theorem 1, to  $P, S, Z$  (even if a priori  $S$  may not compute  $b_X(P)$ ). We get the existence of a line  $L$  such that  $\deg(Z \cap L) < \sharp(S \cap L)$  and  $\deg(Z \cap L) + \sharp(S \cap L) \geq d + 2$ . Since  $d \geq 4$ , we get  $\sharp(S \cap L) \geq 3$ , contradiction. By construction  $\sharp(\mathcal{S}(X_{2,d}, P)) \geq 2$ . If  $m \geq 3$  we get a similar example taking a 2-dimensional linear subspace  $N \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  and taking  $D, S, S', P$  as above. Indeed, it is well-known that every  $A \in \mathcal{S}(X_{m,d}, P)$  is contained in  $\nu_d(N)$ . By construction  $\sharp(\mathcal{S}(X_{2,d}, P)) \geq 2$ . Lemma 2 below will give that  $\mathcal{S}(X_{2,d}, P)$  is infinite, one-dimensional and with a unique positive-dimensional irreducible component.

**Theorem 1.** Fix  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  such that there are finite subsets  $A, B \subset X_{m,d}$  such that  $\sharp(A) = \sharp(B) = d + 1$ ,  $P \in \langle A \rangle \cap \langle B \rangle$ ,  $P \notin \langle A' \rangle$  for any  $A' \subsetneq A$ ,  $P \notin \langle B' \rangle$  for any  $B' \subsetneq B$  and  $A \neq B$ . Write  $A = \nu_d(S)$  and  $B = \nu_d(S')$ . Assume that no 3 points of  $S \cup S'$  are collinear. Then  $m \geq 2$  and there are a plane  $N \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  and  $D, S, S'$  as in Example 1. If  $d \geq 4$ , then  $\mathcal{S}(X, P)$  is one-dimensional and  $E \in \mathcal{S}(X_{m,d}, P)$  if and only if  $E = \nu_d(F)$  with  $F \subset D$  and  $\nu_d(F)$  computing the  $\nu_d(D)$ -rank of  $P$ .

If one of the sets  $A$  or  $B$  is very special, then often the other must be special, too.

**Proposition 1.** Fix  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  such that there are finite subsets  $A, B \subset X_{m,d}$  such that  $\sharp(A) = \sharp(B) = d + 1$ ,  $P \in \langle A \rangle \cap \langle B \rangle$ ,  $P \notin \langle A' \rangle$  for any  $A' \subsetneq A$ ,  $P \notin \langle B' \rangle$  for any  $B' \subsetneq B$  and  $A \neq B$ . Write  $A = \nu_d(S)$  and  $B = \nu_d(S')$ .

Assume the existence of a plane  $N \subseteq \mathbb{P}^2$  and a smooth conic  $D \subset N$  such that  $S \subset D$ . Then  $S' \subset D$  and  $A, B$  are as in Example 1.

**Lemma 1.** Fix positive integers  $m \geq 2$ ,  $d \geq 2$  and  $s \leq 2d + 2$ . Let  $E \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  be a subset such that  $\sharp(S) = s$  and no 3 of its points are collinear. Then  $h^1(\mathcal{I}_E(d)) > 0$  if and only if  $s = 2d + 2$  and there is a plane  $N \subseteq \mathbb{P}^m$  and a smooth conic  $D \subset N$  such that  $E \subset D$ .

*Proof.* The “if” part is obvious. To check the other implication we assume  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^m, \mathcal{I}_E(d)) > 0$ . We mention that the case  $s \leq 2d + 1$  is classical. First assume  $m = 2$ . Let  $D \subset \mathbb{P}^2$  be a smooth conic containing the maximal number of points of  $E$ . Now assume  $m > 2$  and that the result is true in  $\mathbb{P}^m$ . In  $\mathbb{P}^m$  we use induction on  $d$  (leaving to the reader the case  $d = 1$  in which no such  $E$  exists). Let  $M \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  be a hyperplane such that  $\sharp(M \cap E)$  is maximal. If  $E \subset M$ , then it is sufficient to use the inductive assumption. Hence we may assume  $E \cap M \neq E$ . Thus  $\sharp(E \cap M) \leq 2d + 1$ . The inductive assumption gives  $h^1(M, \mathcal{I}_{M \cap E}(d)) = 0$ . Since  $M \cap E$  is maximal, we have  $\sharp(M \cap E) \geq 3$ . Thus  $\sharp(E \setminus (E \cap M)) \leq 2(d - 1) + 1$ . The inductive assumption on  $d$  gives  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^m, \mathcal{I}_{E \setminus (E \cap M)}(d - 1)) = 0$ . Hence Castelnuovo’s inequality gives  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^m, \mathcal{I}_E(d)) = 0$ , contradiction.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.** Fix an integer  $d \geq 2$ , a rational normal curve  $C \subset \mathbb{P}^{2d}$  and  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{2d} \setminus \sigma_d(C)$ . Then  $r_C(P) = d + 1$  and  $\mathcal{S}(X, P)$  is one-dimensional. Moreover,  $\mathcal{S}(X, P)$  has a unique positive-dimensional irreducible component.

*Proof.* Let  $J(C, \dots, C) \subset C^{d+1} \times \mathbb{P}^{2d}$  be the abstract join of  $d + 1$  copies of  $C$  and  $\pi : J(C, \dots, C) \rightarrow \mathbb{P}^{2d}$  the proper morphism induced by the projection  $C^{d+1} \times \mathbb{P}^{2d} \rightarrow \mathbb{P}^{2d}$ . Since the secant varieties and the joins of any curve have the expected dimension, we have  $\dim(J(C, \dots, C)) = 2d + 1$ ,  $b_C(P) = d + 1$ , and  $\pi$  is surjective. A classical theorem of Sylvester gives  $r_C(P) = d + 1$  (see [3], Theorem 1). Hence  $\pi^{-1}(P)$  contains infinitely many reduced fibers, i.e.  $\mathcal{S}(C, P)$  is positive-dimensional. Fix  $S, S' \in \mathcal{S}(C, P)$  such that  $S \neq S'$ . Since any subset of  $C$  with cardinality at most  $2d + 1$  is linearly independent (see [2], Lemma 1), gives  $S \cap S' = \emptyset$ . Since  $\dim(C) = 1$  and  $C$  is irreducible, we get that  $\mathcal{S}(C, P)$  has at most one positive-dimensional irreducible component.  $\square$

*Proof of Theorem 1.* Since  $d + 1 \geq 3$  and no 3 points of  $S$  are collinear,  $m \geq 2$ . By [2], Lemma 1, we have  $h^1(\mathcal{I}_{S \cup S'}(d)) = 0$ . Lemma 1 gives the existence of a plane  $N \subseteq \mathbb{P}^2$  and a smooth conic  $D \subset N$  such that  $S \cup S' \subset D$ . Take  $P, N, A, B, S, S'$  as in Example 1. Fix another element  $\nu_d(S'')$  of  $\mathcal{S}(X, P)$ . The “only if” part of the theorem just proved gives  $S'' \cap S' = S'' \cap S = \emptyset$  and

the existence of smooth conics  $D', D''$  such that  $S \cup S'' \subset D'$  and  $S' \cup S'' \subset D''$ . Since two different smooth conics have at most 4 common points and  $\sharp(S) = d + 1 \geq 5$ , we get  $D' = D'' = D$ . Notice that  $P \in \langle \nu_d(D) \rangle$  and that  $\nu_d(D)$  is a rational normal curve of its linear span  $\langle \nu_d(D) \rangle \cong \mathbb{P}^{2d}$ . Since  $b_{\nu_d(D)}(P) \leq b_{X_{m,d}}(P) = d + 1$  and the secant varieties of any curve have the expected dimension, we get  $P \in \langle \nu_d(D) \rangle \setminus \sigma_d(\nu_d(D))$ . Hence Lemma 2 concludes the proof.  $\square$

*Proof of Proposition 1.* By [2], Lemma 1, we have  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^m, \mathcal{I}_{S \cup S'}(d)) > 0$ . As in the proof of Lemma 1 we get  $S \cap S' = \emptyset$ . First assume  $m = 2$ . Set  $E := S' \setminus (S' \cap D)$ . In order to obtain a contradiction we assume  $E \neq \emptyset$ . Thus  $\deg((S \cup S') \cap D) \leq 2d + 1$ . Thus  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_{S \cup S'}(d)) > 0$ . Castelnuovo's inequality gives  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_E(d - 2)) > 0$ . By [3], Lemma 1, there is a line  $L \subset \mathbb{P}^2$  such that  $\sharp(L \cap E) \geq d$ . Set  $F := (S \cup S') \cap L$ . First assume  $\sharp(F) \leq d + 1$ . Thus  $h^1(L, \mathcal{I}_F(d)) = 0$ . Since  $\sharp(F) \geq d$ , we have  $\sharp((S \cup S') \setminus F) \leq d + 2$ . Since  $h^1(L, \mathcal{I}_F(d)) = 0$ , Castelnuovo's inequality gives  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_{(S \cup S') \setminus F}(d - 1)) = 0$ . Hence there is a line  $R \subset \mathbb{P}^2$  such that  $\sharp(R \cap ((S \cup S') \setminus F)) \geq d + 1$ . Since at least  $d - 1$  of the points of  $(S \cup S') \setminus F$  are contained in  $D$  and no 3 of the points of  $D$  are collinear, we got a contradiction. Now assume  $\sharp(F) \geq d + 2$ . Thus  $\sharp(S \cup S') \setminus F \leq d$ . Thus  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_{(S \cup S') \setminus F}(d - 1)) = 0$ . Since  $S \cap S' = \emptyset$ , we get  $\langle \nu_d(S) \rangle \cap \langle \nu_d(S') \rangle = \langle \nu_d(S \cap L) \rangle \cap \langle \nu_d(S' \cap L) \rangle$ . Since  $S \cap L \subsetneq S$ , we got a contradiction.

Now assume  $m > 2$ . Fix a hyperplane  $M \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  containing  $N$  and such that  $\sharp(M \cap S')$  is maximal among the set of all hyperplanes containing  $M$ . Use the inductive step of the proof of Lemma 1.  $\square$

Decreasing the assumptions we loose the uniqueness of Example 1.

Under suitable (very strong) assumptions we will find out the the next example satisfies another uniqueness statement.

**Example 2.** Fix an integer  $d \geq 2$ . Assume  $m \geq 2$  and fix a plane  $N \subseteq \mathbb{P}^n$  and lines  $L, R \subset N$  such that  $L \neq R$ . Fix a subset  $W \subset (L \cup R) \setminus L \cap R$  such that  $\sharp(W \cap L) = \sharp(W \cap R) = d + 1$ . Take any decomposition  $W = S \cup S'$  with  $\sharp(S) = \sharp(S') = d + 1$ . Since  $h^0(L \cup L, \mathcal{O}_{L \cup R}(d)) = 2d + 1$ ,  $L \cup R$  is arithmetically Cohen-Macaulay and each line of  $L \cup R$  contains at most  $d + 1$  points of  $W$ , the set  $\langle \nu_d(S) \rangle \cap \langle \nu_d(S') \rangle$  is a single point. We have  $\{S, S'\} \subseteq \mathcal{S}(X_{m,d}, P)$ . Notice that either  $\sharp(S \cap L) \geq (d + 1)/2$  or  $\sharp(S' \cap R) \geq (d + 1)/2$ .

**Proposition 2.** Fix  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  such that there are finite subsets  $A, B \subset X_{m,d}$  such that  $\sharp(A) = \sharp(B) = d + 1$ ,  $P \in \langle A \rangle \cap \langle B \rangle$ ,  $P \notin \langle A' \rangle$  for any  $A' \subsetneq A$ ,  $P \notin \langle B' \rangle$  for any  $B' \subsetneq B$  and  $A \neq B$ . Write  $A = \nu_d(S)$  and  $B = \nu_d(S')$ . Assume  $\sharp(T \cap (S \cup S')) \leq d + 1$  for every line  $T \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  and the existence of a

line  $L \subset \mathbb{P}^m$  such that  $\sharp(S \cap L) \geq (d+1)/2$ . Then there are a line  $R \neq L$  such that  $W := S \cup S'$  is as in Example 2.

*Proof.* By [2] we have  $S \cap S' = \emptyset$  and  $r_{X_{m,d}}(P) = d+1$ . First assume  $m = 2$ . Set  $F := S \cup S' \setminus (S \cup S') \cap L$ . Since  $\sharp(S \cup S') \cap L \leq d+1$  we have  $h^1(L, \mathcal{I}_{(S \cup S') \cap L}(d)) = 0$ . Since a line is arithmetically Cohen-Macaulay, we get  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_{(S \cup S') \cap L}(d)) = 0$ . Hence [2], Lemma 1, and Castelnuovo's inequality gives  $h^1(\mathbb{P}^2, \mathcal{I}_F(d-1)) > 0$ . Since  $\sharp(F) \leq 2(d-1) + 1$ , [3], Lemma 1, gives the existence of a line  $R$  such that  $\sharp(F \cap R) \geq d+1$ . Since  $S \cup S'$  is reduced,  $F \cap L = \emptyset$ . Thus  $R \neq L$ . By assumption we have  $\sharp(F \cap R) = d+1$  and the point  $R \cap L$  is not contained in  $S \cup S'$ . Thus we are in the situation described in Example 2. The case  $m > 2$  easily follows by induction on  $m$  as in the proof of Lemma 1.  $\square$

**Remark 1.** Fix  $P \in \mathbb{P}^{\binom{m+d}{m}-1}$  such that  $b_{X_{m,d}}(P) \leq d+1$ . By [4], Lemma 2.1.5, or [3], Proposition 1,  $b_{X_{m,d}}(P)$  is the minimal integer  $t$  such that there is a zero-dimensional smoothable subscheme  $Z \subset X_{m,d}$  such that  $P \in \langle Z \rangle$ . Hence [2], Theorem 1 gives that all points  $P$  appearing in the statements of Theorem 1 and Propositions 1 and 2 have border rank  $d+1$ .

### Acknowledgements

The author was partially supported by MIUR and GNSAGA of INdAM (Italy).

### References

- [1] E. Ballico, Points of a projective space with a prescribed number of subsets computing their  $X$ -rank, *Preprint*.
- [2] E. Ballico, A. Bernardi, Decomposition of homogeneous polynomials with low rank, *Preprint*.
- [3] A. Bernardi, A. Gimigliano, M. Idà, On the stratification of secant varieties of Veronese varieties via symmetric rank, *ArXiv: math.AG/0908.1651v5; J. Symbolic. Comput.*, To Appear.
- [4] J. Buczyński, A. Ginensky, J.M. Landsberg, Determinantal equations for secant varieties and the Eisenbud-Koh-Stillman conjecture, *ArXiv: math.AG/1007.0192*.

- [5] J.M. Landsberg, Z. Teitler, On the ranks and border ranks of symmetric tensors, *Found. Comput. Math.*, **10** (2010), 339-366.